

**STATE OF NEW JERSEY** : FINAL ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION : **OF THE** In the Matter of Lisa Dolby, : CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION Advocate Victim Witness Program : (C0676C), Ocean County : : **Examination** Appeal CSC Docket No. 2022-2170 : : : : :

**ISSUED: MAY 23, 2022** (RE)

Lisa Dolby appeals the decision of the Division of Agency Services (Agency Services) which found that she did not meet the experience requirements for the open competitive examination Advocate Victim Witness Program (C0676C), Ocean County.

The subject examination announcement was issued with a closing date of December 21, 2021, and was open to residents of Ocean County who possessed a Bachelor's degree from an accredited college or university, and one year of experience providing advice and referral services to individuals or groups coping with social, emotional, psychological or other problems. Applicants who did not possess the required education could substitute additional experience as indicated on a year-foryear basis. The appellant was found to be below the minimum requirements in experience. Six candidates appear on the eligible list, which has been certified once, but no appointments have yet been made.

The appellant indicated that she possessed a Bachelor's degree and she listed six positions on her application and resume: Advocate Victim Witness Program, Bilingual in Spanish and English; Keyboarding Clerk II, Bilingual in Spanish and English; Keyboarding Clerk I, Bilingual in Spanish and English; Legal Assistant with Law Offices of Santiago & Associates, PC; Executive Administrative Assistant/Co-Owner of Domino's Pizza; and Legal Secretary, with Law Offices of Santiago & Associates, PC. The appellant was credited with ten months of experience in the first position and was found to be lacking two months of required experience. On appeal, the appellant provides her three titles with Ocean County and a new list of duties for each which include her original duties and new duties. In support, the Prosecutor states that in her clerical titles, the appellant frequently spoke to victims and witnesses, fielded incoming calls, assisted all Spanish-speaking persons, provided updates on the status of cases, obtained victim input, assessed needs for services and referred people to social services agencies, and on occasion provided court accompaniment to Spanish-speaking victims.

## CONCLUSION

*N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.3(b) provides that applicants shall meet all requirements specified in the open competitive examination announcement by the closing date.

At the outset, it is noted that titles are categorized as professional, paraprofessional or non-professional. *N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.5(a)1 states that professional titles require a Bachelor's or higher-level degree, with or without a clause to substitute experience for education. Thus, since the title under test title requires a Bachelor's degree with a substitution clause, which permits additional experience in lieu of the completed degree, as well as one year of relevant experience, it is considered a professional title.

The appellant's prior held titles do not require a Bachelor's degree and therefore are not professional titles. *N.J.A.C.* 4A:4-2.5(a)3 states that non-professional titles require less than 60 general college credits or less than 12 specific college credits. As such, the Keyboarding Clerk title series is considered non-professional clerical titles since none of the titles require completion of any college credits. In addition to the requirement of a Bachelor's degree, professional work is basically interpretive, evaluative, analytical and/or creative requiring knowledge or expertise in a specialized field of knowledge. This is generally acquired by a course of intellectual or technical instruction, study and/or research. *See In the Matter of Lewis Gordon* (Commissioner of Personnel, decided September 27, 1997) (Youth Worker title series not considered to be at a level and scope consistent with professional experience). Experience acquired in para-professional or non-professional titles does not technically satisfy the requirements for eligibility in higher level category titles. *See In the Matter of Irma Camilo* (MSB, decided February 9, 2005).

On appeal the appellant provides additional duties for her Keyboarding Clerk II, Bilingual in Spanish and English and Keyboarding Clerk I, Bilingual in Spanish and English positions. A review of those duties indicates that they emphasize bilingual abilities, but do not rise to the level and scope of professional work. The appellant's duties as a Legal Assistant and Legal Secretary are also clerical. The appellant's experience as an Executive Administrative Assistant/Co-Owner of Domino's Pizza is inapplicable. While the appellant possesses the required Bachelor's

degree and ten months of applicable experience in her provisional position, the list is complete, containing the names of six eligibles. Therefore, there is no basis on which to relax the controlling regulatory provision to accept her provisional experience gained after the closing date. As the appellant falls two months short of experience as of the December 2021 closing date, she was properly deemed ineligible.

A thorough review of the record indicates that the appellant has failed to support her burden of proof in this matter.

## ORDER

Therefore, it is ordered that this appeal be denied.

This is the final administrative determination in this matter. Any further review should be pursued in a judicial forum.

DECISION RENDERED BY THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION ON THE 18<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF MAY, 2022

Derrare' L. Webster Calib

Deirdré L. Webster Cobb Chairperson Civil Service Commission

Inquiries and Correspondence Allison Chris Myers Director Division of Appeals and Regulatory Affairs Civil Service Commission Written Record Appeals Unit P. O. Box 312 Trenton, New Jersey 08625-0312

c: Lisa Dolby Robert Greitz Division of Agency Services Records Center